

City of Canyon Lake Public Safety Advisory Committee

October 5, 2011 · Amended

On January 18, 2011 the City of Canyon Lake City Council formed a Public Safety Ad Hoc Committee. This committee was created to study apparent short falls to funding the fire and police services provided to the City of Canyon Lake and the possibility of establishing a municipal fire department. The committee was tasked to review both Fire and Police services in Canyon Lake. This included looking at the City's options and corresponding funding and revenue.

The committee was to identify, analyze, prioritize and quantify all possible and viable options for provisions of public safety services to the City.

The Committee has completed considerable due diligence in this matter using an unbiased approach during the ensuing eight months. This involved meetings with Riverside County Fire and Sheriff administrative personnel to review the Canyon Lake proposed budgets and possible cost savings. The Ad Hoc Committee was impressed with the professionalism and cooperation that both Fire and Police disciplines exhibited during the interview process.

Currently, Mayor Talbot has conducted meetings with Supervisor Buster and others to better define the public safety needs of the City of Canyon Lake and the revenue available. These discussions included a review of existing Police and Fire contracts for service. Additionally, ongoing discussions have occurred with adjacent municipalities to look at the possibility of regionalization of certain public safety services. Accordingly, the committee is not addressing these items in this report.

Part of the Committee's task was to evaluate the possibility of a municipal fire department in Canyon Lake. The Public Safety Ad Hoc Committee was also charged to review and evaluate the "Fire Protection Proposal" (FPP) submitted to the City of Canyon Lake by Canyon Lake resident, Patrick Colleary. In analyzing the costs of a municipal fire department the committee utilized the personnel formula presented in the FPP. The analysis showed that the personnel formula, when combined with other operating costs not included in the FPP, would be as costly, or more costly, than the existing services provided by Riverside County/Cal Fire. Attachment A is a compilation for comparison purposes to the budget submitted as part of the FPP, while it also addresses some of the additional costs for a Municipal Fire Department.

- **Emergency Medical/Paramedic:** The FPP fails to include monetary considerations for the maintenance of a Paramedic program. This would include the hiring of an Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Compliance Coordinator to interface with the County's EMS Department in the areas of Quality Assurance and continuing education programs. The committee determined that \$45,000 per year is the minimum for this service.
- **Benefits:** A committee member with extensive background in Human Relations and business reviewed actual budgets from public safety agencies and determined that the line item for benefits should be a minimum of 35 percent. Benefit costs were not addressed in the FPP's Personnel Costs. Deficiencies were found in omitting the following items which have been added to Attachment A in the amount of \$226,993:

Medical Insurance
 Payroll Taxes
 Unemployment Insurance
 Worker's Comp
 Uniform Allowance
 Retirement

A "PARS" retirement system was suggested by the FPP's author. After research with PARS it was determined that they do not offer services to part time employees and more importantly, the City is not able to bifurcate the existing system and have one retirement system (PERS) for non-fire personnel and a separate system for fire personnel. Additionally the committee was told by a PARS administrator that their system would cost the city more.

- **Disaster Preparedness:** The Topic of Disaster Management was not addressed or budgeted by the FPP.
- **Automatic Aid:** The Committee was told by the Riverside County Fire Chief that if the City started their own fire department they would need to provide "like for like" services in order to receive automatic aid at no cost. The FPP proposal, using volunteers and part time staff, is not at the same level as surrounding departments that would be providing automatic aid. Therefore, there would be a cost for automatic aid that was not included in the proposal. Additionally, since the proposal is not establishing a level A Municipal Fire Department, the City could experience a delay in the access we now have to multiple resources, available through Cal Fire, for the following when needed:

Respectively submitted:

City of Canyon Lake
Public Safety Ad Hoc Committee

Larry Greene, Chair
Travis Montgomery, Vice Chair
Robert Bohan
Gary Bradford
Frank Brown

Marty Hairabedian
Anne Norris
Michael Petty
Jack Wamsley

* See Attachment A, researched and compiled by the Ad Hoc Committee.

| AD HOC Findings | | | | |
|-------------------------------|---------------|------------------------------|--|------------------------|
| | <u>Number</u> | <u>Full or Half Time</u> | <u>Note</u> | <u>Cost</u> |
| <u>Staff Support</u> | | | | |
| Fire Chief | 1 | Full | | \$ 120,000.00 |
| Battalion Chief | 2 | Half | | \$ 40,000.00 |
| Fire Captain | 2.5 | Half | \$60k pa | \$ 150,000.00 |
| Engineer | 2.5 | | \$40k | \$ 100,000.00 |
| Firefighter | 2.5 | | \$33k | \$ 82,500.00 |
| | | | Sub Total | \$ 492,500.00 |
| | | | Worker's Comp | \$ 54,618.00 |
| | | | Benefits @ 35% | \$ 172,375.00 |
| | | | Overtime @ 20% | \$ 98,500.00 |
| | | | Sub Total | \$ 325,493.00 |
| Volunteer | 14 | | | \$ 25,200.00 |
| Intern | 28 | | | \$ 124,100.00 |
| | | | Worker's Comp | \$ 25,058.00 |
| Sub Total | | | Sub Total | \$ 174,358.00 |
| Total Staffing | | | Staff Total | \$ 992,351.00 |
| <u>Service Support</u> | | | | |
| Fuel | | | | \$ 15,000.00 |
| Repairs | | | | \$ 33,000.00 |
| Utilities | | | | \$ 20,000.00 |
| Air bottles | | | | \$ 3,000.00 |
| | | | Safety Gear (52.5 Persons) | \$ 105,000.00 |
| Dispatch | | | | \$ 136,000.00 |
| Secretarial | | | Clerical w/benefits Administration * | \$ 50,000.00 |
| | | | Medic | \$ 45,000.00 |
| | | | Training | \$ 10,000.00 |
| | | | Liability Insurance | \$ 40,030.00 |
| | | | Sub Total | \$ 595,670.00 |
| | | | TOTAL | \$ 1,588,021.00 |
| | | | *Administation includes the following costs: | |
| | | | Audit, Legal, Human Resources, Financial, Payroll, | |
| | | | Information Technology, Admin. City Manager, | |
| | | | Admin. City Clerk, Admin. Financial | |